

**Identification, Concept and
Bibliometric Analyses of Knowledge
Translation Theories/Frameworks**

**CIHR September 2003
Resubmission March 2004**

Investigator team

Ian Graham (PI), Jo Logan (PI)

- **Doug Angus**
- **Melissa Brouwers**
- **Barbara Davies**
- **Michelle Driedger**
- **Martin Eccles**
- **Robbie Foy**
- **Gaston Godin**
- **Jeremy Grimshaw**
- **Margaret Harrison**
- **Sylvie Lauzon**
- **France Legare**
- **Louise Lemyre**
- **Jessie McGowen**
- **Marie-Pascale Pomey**
- **Dawn Stacey**
- **Jacqueline Tetroe**
- **Michel Wensign**

Change Theories

- **Classical: passive descriptive models eg. diffusion theory**
- **Planned: action models -**

Objective 1

- **to conduct a focused search for conceptual models, frameworks, and grand theories of planned change.**

Objective 2

- **to undertake a theory analysis of the identified models/theories to determine their strengths and limitations and to determine similarities and differences between them.**

Theory Analysis

- **systematic examination of a theory or theories and is an essential component of theory development**

Theory Analysis

- 1) to determine the origins of the theory.
who, where, why, when**
- 2) to examine the meaning of the theory
concepts, relationships**
- 3) to analyze the logical consistency of the
theory.**
- 4) to define the degree of generalizability and
parsimony of the theory**
- 5) to determine the testability of the theory.**

Objective 3

- **to determine the extent to which each theory has been used and/or tested and the contexts and populations in which it has been used and/or tested.**
 - **bibliometric analysis using the science and social science citation journals**

Deliverables

- 1. An inventory or list of planned change models, frameworks or grand theories.**
- 2. A KT Theories User's Guide which would synthesize all the planned change models/theories and identify common elements of each and provide information on their use.**
- 3. Academic manuscripts describing the results of the theory analysis.**
- 4. A manuscript reflecting on the advantages and challenges of conducting transdisciplinary research on KT theory.**

CIHR rating

- **Rating: 3.37/5**
 - reviewer #1 4.4,
 - reviewer #2 2.8

- **Rank:7/13**

ISSUES

- **Strong team, experienced leaders**
- **Will further develop KT field**
- **KT theory users guide attractive**
- **Resubmit**

- **Lack citation regarding limitations of theoretical weakness of KT**
 - **Anyone have references?**
- **Value of surveying theory originators**
 - **Intent is to identify other studies using theory**
 - **Fill in gaps related to theory analysis (origins, modifications, historical context)**
 - **To identify last version**
 - **NEVER intended to use survey to have originator's assess value of their theory**
 - **We will include sample survey questions with proposal**
-

- **No assessment of User's Guide**
 - **Theory originators will be asked for feedback**
 - **?survey samples of managers, clinicians, researchers**
- **Methodology for assessing advantages and challenges of working in transdisciplinary team not described**
 - **We are describing the participants' (co-i) perceptions of the project**
 - **Treloar and Graham (2003) pub**

Reviewer #1

- **Team's process for developing the standardized screening form for search results not well defined**
- **Survey of theory originators vague**
- **usefulness of surveying originators' about value of their theory**
- **How will info from theory analysis and bibliometric analysis be integrated**

The idiot reviewer (#2)

- **Unclear why proposal not focused on planned change theories**
 - **Da!**
- **TPB not planned change theory- ‘what’s the point with TPB?’**

- **Theory analysis subjective**
 - **Bibliometric data will be used as potential indicator of testability, generalizability**
- **How are refinements in a theory to be dealt with?**
 - **Modifications will be reported under step 1 (origins)**
 - **Last version will be used for the theory analysis**
- **What about outdated theories- no indication time dimension captured**
 - **We do capture dates on publications and when others citing/using the theory**
 - **Likely few if any theories that are very old**

- **CPU costs excessive**
 - ? **Other ways to budget for 1% OHRI tax**
- **Costs of clerk not covered**
 - **We now have a research assistant**